

Application of Foreign Law

edited by

Carlos Esplugues
José Luis Iglesias
Guillermo Palao


sellier.
european law
publishers

ISBN (print) 978-3-86653-155-0
ISBN (eBook) 978-3-86653-912-9

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

© 2011 by sellier. european law publishers GmbH, Munich.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior permission of the publisher.

Production: Karina Hack, Munich. Typesetting: fidus Publikations-Service GmbH, Nördlingen. Printing and binding: Friedrich Pustet KG, Regensburg. Printed on acid-free, non-ageing paper. Printed in Germany.

Table of Contents

List of Authors	XVII
Preface: The Project	XXV
List of Abbreviations	XXIX

Chapter I

General Report on the Application of Foreign Law by Judicial and Non-Judicial Authorities in Europe (Project JLS/CJ/2007-1/03)	3
--	---

I. Introduction	4
------------------------	---

II. Application of Foreign law by Judicial Authorities in Europe	
1. Introduction: the factual/legal condition of foreign law before national courts	8
a. Legal nature of foreign law	10
b. Factual nature of foreign law	13
c. Hybrid nature of foreign law	16
d. Conclusion: the lack of a valid and effective response	17
2. The introduction of foreign law in the case at stake	18
a. The condition granted to choice-of-law rules and the application of foreign law	18
b. The pleading of foreign law before national courts	22
i) Countries endorsing the legal nature of foreign law	22
ii) Countries endorsing the factual nature of foreign law	27
iii) Countries endorsing the hybrid nature of foreign law	28
iv) Conclusion: inconsistencies exist between the theoretical approach upheld and its practical implementation	29
c. Application of foreign law by courts and the “ <i>iura novit curia</i> ” principle	30
i) EU Member States endorsing the factual condition of foreign law	31
ii) EU Member States endorsing the hybrid nature of foreign law	31
iii) EU Member States endorsing the legal condition of foreign law	32

d.	The supplementary role played by the parties as regards the pleading of foreign law	37
3.	The ascertainment of the content of foreign law	38
a.	The role played by the court and the parties as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	38
i)	Countries Endorsing the legal nature of foreign law	39
ii)	Countries Endorsing the factual nature of foreign law	45
iii)	Countries Endorsing the hybrid nature of foreign law	47
b.	The means used to ascertain the content of foreign law	48
i)	EU Member States awarding legal condition to foreign law	49
ii)	EU Member States awarding factual condition to foreign law	53
iii)	EU Member States awarding hybrid condition to foreign law	55
iv)	Some conclusions	56
c.	Existence and application of bilateral/multilateral conventions as regards foreign law	56
d.	Proof of the content of foreign law and legal aid	57
i)	EU Member States awarding legal condition to foreign law	58
ii)	EU Member States awarding either factual or hybrid condition to foreign law	59
e.	When is the content of foreign law deemed sufficiently ascertained?	59
4.	The application of foreign law	64
a.	How is foreign law applied by the judge?	64
b.	What happens in those cases the court considers that the content of foreign law has not been ascertained?	67
c.	Refusal of application of foreign law	73
5.	May the application of foreign law be reviewed by the courts?	75
III. The Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities in Europe		
1.	Introduction	79
2.	The meaning of “non-judicial authorities” regarding the application of foreign law	81
3.	Non-judicial authorities and the application of foreign law	83
4.	The role played by the parties and non-judicial authorities regarding the application of foreign law	87
5.	Consequences of the lack of ascertainment of the content of foreign law	89
6.	Some conclusions	89
IV. Final Remarks		
		90
“Principles for a Future EU Regulation on the Application of Foreign Law (“The Madrid Principles”)		
		95

Chapter 2

Austria and Germany

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. <i>Ex officio</i> ascertainment of foreign law	101
a. General rule	101
b. Legal reality	102
c. Gapfilling	103
2. Modifications of the principle of <i>iura novit curia</i>	104
3. Role of the parties	105
4. Means of ascertainment used by the court	105
5. Sufficient proof	107
6. In case foreign law cannot be ascertained: application of the <i>lex fori</i>	108
7. Review of judgments rendered on the basis of foreign law	110
8. Costs	112
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	113
III. Evaluation of the Austrian/German rule	
1. Broad acceptance of the <i>ex officio</i> approach	113
2. Remaining questions	114

Baltic Countries

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	119
2. Nature of foreign law	120
3. The role of the court and parties regarding the pleading and proof of foreign law	121
4. When and how foreign law is deemed proved	123
5. Grounds for rejecting the application of foreign law	124
6. Possibilities to review judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law	125
7. Conventions regarding the application of foreign law	127
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	127

Belgium

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. Nature of foreign law in Belgium	129
2. Pleading and proof of foreign law: role of the parties and the judge	131
3. Means of ascertainment of foreign law	133

Table of Contents

4. When and how foreign law is deemed established in time?	134
5. How does a court apply foreign law?	135
6. How can gaps be filled and what happens in case of lack of ascertainment of foreign law?	136
7. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	137
8. Review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law	137
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial authorities	139

Bulgaria

I. Introduction	145
II. Legal Rules on Application of Foreign Law	
1. Code of Private International Law	146
2. International Conventions on proof of foreign law	147
III. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. Legal nature of foreign law	147
2. The principle " <i>iura novit curia</i> "	148
3. Pleading and proof of foreign law	149
4. Lack of proof of foreign law	151
5. Costs for ascertainment of the foreign law	152
6. Appeal based on the insufficient or incorrect application/ interpretation of foreign law	153
7. Rejection of application of foreign law	154
IV. Main Features of the Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. Non-judicial authorities applying foreign law	154
2. Application of foreign law by non-judicial authorities	154
3. Pleading and proof of foreign law by non-judicial authorities	159
V. Conclusion	159

Cyprus

I. General Overview	161
II. Pleading Foreign Law	162
III. Proving Foreign Law	164

IV. The Role of the Trial Judge	166
V. Failure to Prove Foreign Law	168
VI. The Right to Review Foreign Law	170
VII. Review of Foreign Law on Appeal	170
VIII. Concluding Remarks	171

Czech Republic and Slovak Republic

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General introduction	173
2. Brief history of legal regulation	174
3. Fundamental principles of the current legal regulation regarding the application of foreign law	175
a. Duty to apply foreign law	175
b. Foreign law is treated as law	175
c. The principle “ <i>iura novit curia</i> ” and the duty to ascertain the content of foreign law	176
d. Application of foreign law	176
e. Exceptions	176
4. Ascertaining of the content of foreign law	177
5. Application of the <i>lex fori</i> instead of foreign law	179
6. Review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law	181
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General introduction	181
2. Review of the decision rendered on the basis of foreign law	182

France

I. Introduction	185
II. The Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. The introduction of foreign law in the case	186
a. The ubiquitous distinction of available and unavailable rights	187
b. The mandatory character of the choice of law rule when unavailable rights are involved	188
c. The optional application of the choice of law rule when available rights are involved	188
2. The ascertainment of foreign law	189
a. The burden of proof	190

Table of Contents

b. The available modes of proof	190
c. The interpretation of foreign sources	192
d. Failure to establish foreign law	192
3. The exclusion of foreign law on the ground of public policy	193
a. The French doctrine of “ <i>ordre public international</i> ”	193
b. The activation of the public policy mechanism	194
4. Wrongful application of foreign law	195
a. The theory of equivalence	195
b. The grounds of the review of appellate decisions by the <i>Cour de cassation</i>	195
III. The Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. The introduction of foreign law in the case	197
2. The ascertainment of foreign law	197
3. The exclusion of foreign law	198

Greece

I. Introduction	201
II. Historical Background: The Treatment of Foreign Law Under the Code of Civil Procedure of 1834	201
III. Legal Nature of Foreign Law	203
IV. The Judicial Treatment of Foreign Law	203
V. Proof of Foreign Law	205
VI. The Consequences of the Failure to Prove Foreign Law	207
VII. Judicial Control	209
VIII. Public Policy	210

Hungary

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	213
2. Legal nature of foreign law in Hungary	214
3. The role played by the judge and by the parties as regards proof of foreign law and the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	215
4. When and how is foreign law deemed proved?	217
5. How is foreign law applied by the court and how are gaps filled?	217

6. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	217
7. Possibilities of reviewing the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law by upper courts	220
8. Is there any bilateral/multilateral convention as regards the proof of foreign law applicable? How do they work in practice?	221
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	223
2. Specific features (differences and identities compared with judicial authorities)	225
a. Application of foreign law in notarial proceedings	225
i) Probate proceedings	225
ii) Drafting of wills	227
b. Application of foreign law before court proceedings in family cases	227
i) Proceedings of the registrar for contracting marriage	228
ii) Registration of non-marital cohabitation	228
iii) International adoption	229
iv) Paternal recognition	229

Ireland

I. Introduction	231
II. Legal or Factual Nature Granted to Foreign Law in Ireland	231
III. The Role Played by the Judge and by the Parties as Regards the Plea and/or proof of Foreign Law and the Means Referred to as Regards the Ascertainment of its Content	232
IV. The Specific Case of Canon Law Before Irish Courts	234
V. Final Remarks	235

Italy

I. General Overview	237
II. The Nature of Foreign Law: Article 14 of the Italian Reform of PIL	239
III. The Role Played by the Judge and by the Parties	242
IV. The Ascertainment of the Content of Foreign Law	244

V. The Proof of the Content of Foreign Law	245
VI. Problems on the Application of Foreign Law	246
VII. Reasons for Rejecting the Application of Foreign Law	248
VIII. The Review of Judgements Rendered in Application of Foreign Law	249
IX. International Conventions	249

Luxembourg

I. Preliminary Remarks	255
II. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	255
2. Nature of foreign Law	256
3. The role played by judges and parties concerning the pleading and proof of foreign law	256
4. The proper moment to prove foreign law, the object and means of proof	257
5. Applying and rejecting the application of foreign law	260
6. Possibilities of review by Upper Courts	260
7. International conventions on proof of foreign law	260
III. Application of Foreign Law by Non-judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	261
2. Divergences among judicial and non-judicial systems	261
IV. Some Final Comments	261

Malta

I. Introduction	265
II. Legal or Factual Nature Granted to Foreign Law	266
III. Pleading Foreign Law and Ascertaining its Content	266
IV. The Means Referred to by the Court and/or by the Parties as Regards the Ascertainment of the Content of Foreign Law	269
V. Failure to Proof Foreign Law	270

VI. Rejection of the Application of Foreign Law by the Court	271
VII. Possibilities of Review of the Judgment rendered on the basis of Foreign Law by Courts of Second Instance Superior Courts	272
VIII. Bilateral/Multilateral Conventions Regarding the Proof of Foreign Law	273
IX. Final Remarks	273

Poland

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	275
2. Legal nature attributed to foreign law	276
3. The role played by the judge and by the parties as regards the plea and proof of foreign law	279
4. The means by which the content of foreign law may be ascertained. Cooperation between the court and the parties	283
5. The sufficient determination of the content of foreign law in a reasonable time	286
6. Rejecting the application of foreign law	287
7. Possibilities of review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law	289
8. Multilateral and bilateral conventions as regards the proof of foreign law	290
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	291
2. Similarities and differences between the system of application of foreign law by judicial and non-judicial authorities	292
III. Final Comments and Conclusions	294

Portugal

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	301
2. Legal or factual nature granted to foreign law in the specific country dealt with	302
3. The role played by the judge and by the parties as regards the plea and/or proof of foreign law and the possibility/obligation of cooperation between them as regards these two issues	303
4. The means referred to by the court and/or by the parties as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	303

5. When and how is foreign law deemed proved? Meaning of proof in a reasonable time	304
6. How is foreign law applied by the court? How are gaps filled?	306
7. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	307
a. Public policy (<i>ordre public</i>)	307
b. Mandatory rules	309
c. Unconstitutionality	310
8. Possibilities of review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law by Upper Courts	311
9. Is there any Bilateral/Multilateral convention as regards the proof of foreign law applicable? How do they work in practice?	311
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	312
2. In case any specific system exists as regards this issue, which are the main similarities/differences in relation with the system of application of foreign law by judicial authorities	313
 Romania	
I. Short Introduction	317
II. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. Legal nature granted to foreign law in Romania	318
2. The role played by the judge and the parties as regards the pleading and/or proof of foreign law and the possibility/obligation of cooperation between them as regards these two issues	319
a. Application	319
b. Ascertainment of the content of foreign law	319
3. The means referred to by the court and/or the parties as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	320
4. When and how foreign law is deemed proved in a reasonable time?	321
5. How is foreign law applied by the court? How are gaps filled?	321
6. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	322
7. Possibilities of review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law by Upper Courts	322
8. Existing bilateral/multilateral conventions as regards the proof of foreign law and the way they work	323
III. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	324
2. Which are the main similarities/differences regarding the system of application of foreign law by judicial authorities?	324

Scandinavian Countries

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	327
2. Legal and factual nature of foreign law	329
3. The role played by the judge or the parties	330
4. The means referred to by the court and/or by the parties as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	331
5. When and how is foreign law deemed proved? Meaning of proof in a reasonable time	332
6. How is foreign law applied by the court? How are gaps filled?	334
7. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	335
8. Possibilities of review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law by Upper Courts	337
9. Bilateral and multilateral agreements	337
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	337
2. Special characteristics	341
a. Ombudsman institution	341
b. Appeal procedure	342

Slovenia

I. Introduction	345
II. Foreign Law – Legal Nature and Main Features	345
III. Pleading, Proving and Applying Foreign Law	
1. Pleading and proving foreign law before judicial and non-judicial authorities	347
2. The nature of the conflict of laws rules	349
3. The role of the parties	349
4. Costs concerning the application of the foreign law	350
5. Assistance on the application of foreign law by the Ministry of Justice	350
6. Legal remedies in case of non-application or misapplication of the foreign law	351
7. The foreign law and provisions which effects are contrary to the domestic public order	352
IV. International Commitments on the Basis of International Conventions	353
V. Conclusion	353

Spain

I. Introduction	355
II. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	356
2. The “hybrid” character granted to foreign law	357
3. The role played by judges and parties concerning the pleading and proof of foreign law	358
4. The proper moment to prove foreign law, means and object of proof	360
a. The proper moment to prove foreign law	361
b. Means of proof of foreign law	361
c. The object of proof	362
5. Assessing the final application or rejection of foreign law	363
6. Possibilities of review by upper courts	364
7. International conventions on proof of foreign law	366
III. Application of Foreign Law by Non-judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	368
2. Divergences between judicial and non-judicial authorities regarding the application of foreign law	369
3. The consequences of the lack of proof of foreign law	371
IV. Some Final Remarks	372

The Netherlands

I. Introduction	377
II. The Dutch Approach towards the Application of Foreign Law	
1. General overview – the legal nature of foreign law	377
2. The role played by the judge and the parties and the means as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	380
3. The application of foreign law and the consequences of the lack of proof of foreign law	383
4. Conventions	384
5. Application controls	386
III. The Future – the Process of Codification of Dutch Private International Law	388

United Kingdom

I. Application of Foreign Law by Judicial Authorities	
1. General overview	391
2. Legal or factual nature granted to foreign law in the specific country dealt with	392
3. The role played by the judge and by the parties as regards the plea and/or proof of foreign law and the possibility/obligation of co-operation between them as regards these two issues	393
a. Role of the parties	393
b. Role of the judge	395
4. The means referred to by the court and/or by the parties as regards the ascertainment of the content of foreign law	397
5. When and how foreign law is deemed proved? Meaning of proof in a reasonable time	398
6. How is foreign law applied by the court? How are gaps filled?	400
a. England and Wales	400
b. Scotland	401
c. Northern Ireland	402
7. Failure to prove foreign law	402
8. When and how may the application of foreign law be rejected by the court?	404
9. Possibilities of review of the judgment rendered on the basis of foreign law by Upper Courts	404
10. Is there any bilateral/multilateral convention as regards the proof of foreign law applicable? How do they work in practice?	405
II. Application of Foreign Law by Non-Judicial Authorities	
1. The notary public	406
2. General Register Office	407
III. Summary	407